

MINUTES OF THE  
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
AIR QUALITY TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING

Tuesday, April 21, 1998  
MAG Office  
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS PRESENT

*Harry Mitchell, Citizen Representative, Chairman	Michael Kidd for Monica Pastor, Maricopa County Farm Bureau
*Bill Bates, City of Avondale	*Jim Norton, Arizona Rock Products Association
*Patrice Kraus, City of Chandler	*David Martin, Associated General Contractors
Danielle Typinski for Daniel Kyman, Town of Gilbert	*Connie Wilhelm-Garcia, Homebuilders Association of Central Arizona
Doug Kukino, City of Glendale	*H. Maynard Blumer, American Institute of Architects- Central Arizona
Christine Zielonka, City of Mesa	*Peter Allard, Valley Forward
Gaye Knight, City of Phoenix	*Ian Calkins, Phoenix Chamber of Commerce
Larry Person, City of Scottsdale	*Terry Michael, University of Arizona - Cooperative Extension
Mike Short for Mary O'Conner, City of Tempe	*Tom Russell, Arizona Nursery Association
*Walter Bouchard, Citizen Representative	Stephanie Bondeson, Arizona Department of Transportation
*Arve Dahl, Citizen Representative	Phillip DeNee for Randy Sedlacek, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality
*David Rueckert, Citizen Representative	Jo Crumbaker, Maricopa County Division of Air Pollution Control
David Feuerherd, Arizona Lung Association	Mark Ellery for Dennis Ehrhart, Arizona Department of Weights and Measures
*Marv Cronberg, Arizona Automobile Association	Dennis Mittelstedt, Federal Highway Administration
Greg Witherspoon, Salt River Project	Judi Nelson, Arizona State University
Brian O'Donnell, Southwest Gas Corporation	
Jim Mikula for Scott Davis, Arizona Public Service Company	
Gina Grey, Western States Petroleum Association	
*Bryan Jungwirth, Regional Public Transportation Authority	
*Dave Berry, Arizona Motor Transport Association	

\*Those members neither present nor represented by proxy.

OTHERS PRESENT

Lindy Bauer, Maricopa Association of Governments	Cari Anderson, Kleinfelder
Cathy Arthur, Maricopa Association of Governments	B. Bobby Ramirez, Salt River Indian Community
Allan Kosecki, Maricopa Association of Governments	Pamela Manson, Tribune
Michael Golden, Maricopa Association of Governments	Steven Barr, Lewb and Roca
Chris Voigt, Maricopa Association of Governments	Kelly McMullen, Maricopa County Department of Transportation

A meeting of the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee was conducted on Tuesday, April 21 at 1:30 p.m. Gaye Knight, City of Phoenix, served as Acting Chairman of the Committee. Since a quorum was not present, the meeting was not called to order. However, a discussion began with Agenda Item 3.

3. Most Stringent PM-10 Control Measures

Cathy Arthur, MAG, indicated that Sierra Research has been under contract since November 1997 to provide MAG assistance with the preparation of a request for up to a five-year extension of the PM-10 attainment date. According to the Clean Air Act, the extension request is required to demonstrate that the PM-10 Plan includes the most stringent measures that are contained in any state plan, or are achieved in practice in any other state, and that are feasible in this area. Sierra Research has identified fourteen potential measures for consideration which may be the most stringent in any state for PM-10 sources located in the Maricopa nonattainment.

Ms. Arthur indicated that the latest Draft Most Stringent PM-10 Control Measure Analysis included a list of the PM-10 SIP measures of all states that were screened for consideration. The latest Draft also includes a lower cost effectiveness value for CARB Diesel because it now includes the impact of nonroad vehicles. Furthermore, the latest draft addresses the comments of David Baron in his April 3, 1998 letter to MAG. Ms. Arthur indicated that copies of the letter were available. The next step in the analysis will include an econometric analysis of the potential most stringent measures.

Ms. Arthur indicated that this agenda item was for information, discussion, and recommendation to approve fourteen potential measures for consideration which may be the most stringent in any state for PM-10 sources located in the Maricopa nonattainment area and request that the potential implementing entities consider them for implementation, if feasible.

Greg Witherspoon, Salt River Project, asked what type of information the econometric analysis will provide.

Ms. Arthur indicated that the econometric analysis would give information on the tax consequences, job loss, and other macroscale impacts of the measures.

Gaye Knight, City of Phoenix, asked what will be expected from cities and towns by July 31, 1998.

Lindy Bauer, MAG, indicated that MAG will be asking for new commitments from cities and towns by July 31, 1998. These commitments will relate to clean burning fireplaces, PM-10 efficient street sweepers, unpaved roads, shoulders, unpaved parking lots and vacant lots. MAG is currently working on developing information to assist cities and towns in targeting unpaved roads and shoulders for paving. The information may include areas with elevated PM-10, and specific soil types. Commitments will also be needed to strengthen the enforcement of Maricopa County Rule 310 by individual jurisdiction.

Ms. Knight asked if commitments to enforce Rule 310 by the cities and towns will reduce the County's responsibility to hire more enforcement agents.

Ms. Bauer indicated that the County will hire additional enforcement agents for the Moderate Area FIP. The commitments from the cities and towns will be for the Serious Area SIP.

Jo Crumbaker, Maricopa County Environmental Services Department, indicated that the commitments from cities and towns will be concentrated on the unpaved road and vacant lots part of Rule 310.

1. Call to Order

At this point a quorum had been reached. Ms. Knight called the meeting to order.

3. Most Stringent PM-10 Control Measures (continued)

Gina Grey, Western States Petroleum Association, asked if the costs associated with the implementation of CARB Diesel or other clean Diesel fuel includes the cost to California.

Ms. Arthur indicated that the cost only includes the additional 6 cents per gallon, but Sierra Research could look into incorporating the cost to California.

Ms. Grey indicated that the nonroad Diesel engine PM emission factors used in the analysis were based on data collected in the early 1970's. Ms. Grey asked if it would make sense to use more current factors.

Ms. Arthur indicated that the emission factors are being used in the current modeling for the PM-10 Serious Area SIP and were used in this analysis to be consistent with the SIP.

Ms. Grey indicated that the error margins for CARB Diesel are larger than other measures in the analysis and recommended that a error range estimate be incorporated into the Most Stringent Control Measure Summary Table.

Ms. Arthur indicated that the table could be revised for the next draft. A revised table will be made available to the Air Quality Policy Committee and at the MAG Regional Council meetings.

Mr. Witherspoon asked why the firewood moisture limit measure was included in the analysis since it is not a problem in this area.

Ms. Bauer indicated that the firewood moisture limit measure is considered a most stringent measure. However, it is not applicable to this area since the wood is fairly dry already due to climate conditions. In this case, Maricopa County would indicate this in their response back to MAG.

Ms. Knight asked when the final report could be expected.

Ms. Arthur indicated that the report should be final in May.

Christine Zielonka, City of Mesa, made a motion to recommend to approve fourteen potential measures for consideration which may be the most stringent in any state for PM-10 sources located

in the Maricopa nonattainment area and request that the potential implementing entities consider them for implementation, if feasible. Phillip DeNee, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality, seconded the motion. The motion passed with one abstention (Ms. Grey).

4. Proposed Moderate Area PM-10 Federal Implementation Plan for Unpaved Roads, Vacant Lots, and Parking Lots

Ms. Bauer indicated that the EPA conducted a public workshop on April 16, 1998 on the proposed Moderate Area PM-10 Federal Implementation Plan (FIP) for the Maricopa nonattainment area. The FIP includes a fugitive dust control rule to control PM-10 emissions from vacant lots, unpaved parking lots, and unpaved roads. The rule requires that all public unpaved roads with greater than 150 average daily trips be paved, chemically stabilized, or graveled by June 10, 2000; vacant lots with disturbed surfaces over 0.10 acres must be stabilized; and, vacant lots with motor vehicle disturbances must place signs or fencing to prohibit vehicle access. The rule allows owners or operators of affected properties to submit alternative measures to EPA for approval. The proposed FIP will be finalized by July 18, 1998.

EPA intends to hire a consultant to identify areas that will be affected by this rule. The EPA will be transmitting the surveys that the cities and towns completed regarding the amount of vacant lots, unpaved roads, and parking lots in their jurisdiction. Before the surveys are transmitted to the consultant, MAG will send the surveys back to the cities in the event that any changes need to be made.

Brian O'Donnell, Southwest Gas Corporation, asked how the standard of 0.10 acres for vacant lots was determined.

Ms. Knight indicated that the 0.10 acres for vacant lots is in the Maricopa County Rule 310. The EPA is accepting comments on that size.

Kelly McMullen, Maricopa County Department of Transportation, indicated that the EPA has not evaluated the environmental impacts of paving. Also, the EPA bypassed the unfunded mandate rule, since the requirements are already part of Rule 310.

Larry Person, City of Scottsdale, asked how the SIP can replace the FIP if half of the FIP addresses agriculture and the agriculture measures will not be known until 1999.

Ms. Bauer indicated a SIP revision will be prepared by Maricopa County to describe the strengthened enforcement program for Rule 310. This strengthened Rule 310 enforcement program will replace the part of the FIP addressing Maricopa County Rule 310. MAG is talking with EPA about allowing assumptions to be made regarding the future agriculture measures in the SIP submittal.

2. Approval of the March 13, 1998 Meeting Minutes

The Committee reviewed the minutes from the March 13, 1998 meeting. Ms. Grey moved and Mr. Witherspoon seconded and it was unanimously carried to approve the minutes from the March 13, 1998 meeting.

4. Proposed Moderate Area PM-10 Federal Implementation Plan for Unpaved Roads, Vacant Lots, and Parking Lots (Continued)

Doug Kukino, City of Glendale, asked what will be considered as a Best Available Control Measure (BACM). Will EPA consider the strengthened enforcement program with the additional inspectors to be considered BACM, since it exceeds the number of EPA inspectors for the FIP.

Ms. Bauer indicated that MAG is expecting a letter from EPA providing information on BACM.

5. Legislative Update

Ms. Bauer indicated that there are several bills being considered in the Legislature including S.B. 1427.

6. Call to The Public

An opportunity was then provided to members of the public to address the Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee. No comments were presented.

7. Next Meeting

Ms. Knight indicated that the next meeting would be May 14, 1998.